

Response for Pre-Bid Queries of "Third Party Evaluation of the Programme - National Programme for Dairy Development (NPDD) Implemented by the Department of Animal Husbandry and Dairying (DAHD)".

Bid Number: GEM/2024/B/5052449

M/S Trans Rural Agri Consulting Services Pvt. Ltd

Sl.	Page No.	Original Clause of RFP Document	Queries/Suggestions/Remarks	Response by DAHD
1	9	The bidder should have completed minimum 5 (five) Scheme evaluation assignments with any Center/ State/ Union Territory (UT) government department or their agencies in Cooperative/ Fisheries/ Agriculture/ Animal Husbandry/ Food Processing/ Dairying /Rural Development sectors in the last 5 (Five) Financial Years with minimum contract value not less than Rs. 20 Lakhs for each assignment (Study Completion Certificate to be submitted as proof of successful completion) Out of the above 5 study one Study has to be of Central/State government	Kindly relax for Startups and MSEs to make it 10 Lakhs each project.	No Change
2	9	The Bidder should have experience of working/assisting projects in the area of Dairy Value supply chain (Milk Procurement/ Processing/ Sales & Marketing/ Productivity Enhancement Services) in last 3 financial years.	Please allow and relax this condition for MSEs.	No Change
3	9	Average Turnover in last three FYs 5 to 10 Cr. – 12 Marks 10 to 15 Cr. – 16 Marks More than 15 Cr. – 20 Marks	Kindly relax for Startups and MSEs to make it. From 50 Lakhs-1 Crores- 12 Marks From 1-10 Crores- 16 Marks More than Rs 10 Crores - 20 Marks	No Change

M/s BDO India LLP

Sl.	Page No.	Original Clause of RFP Document	Queries/Suggestions/Remarks	Response by DAHD
1	4	In Point 6, "Time frame for completion of the study: 2 months from the date of the Award of Work, with the following broad sub-timelines."	We understand that there are more than 2500 samples to be covered across 12 States and 1 Union Territory. Keeping in view, the sample size and the objective of the study, we request to extend the project completion timeframe from 2 months to 4 months which will allow the successful bidder to ensure holistic coverage and quality output of the assignment.	The Time frame for completion of study has been increased to 3 Months.
2	7	In Point 9.5, " Before the grant is released, the grantee shall execute a bond with two sureties to the President that (a) he will abide by the conditions of the grant by the target dates, if any, specified therein (b) that he will not divert the grants and entrust execution of the scheme or work concerned to another institution(s) or organization(s) and (c) shall abide by any other conditions specified in this agreement and in the event of his failing to comply with the conditions or committing breach of the bond, the grantee and the sureties individually and jointly will be liable to refund to the President of India, the entire amount of the grant with interest at 6% per annum thereon of the sum specified under the bond "	We would request to clarify on the term "grant" and the associated clause given.	Grant is the Fee which would be paid to the successful Bidder
3		In the GeM document (GEM/2024/B/5052449), the bid submission end date is: 24-06-2024 - 18:00	We would request to extend the bid submission deadline from 24 June 2024 and propose extending the deadline by 1 week to 1 July 2024. • We believe that this extension will enable all participating parties to submit their proposals with the thoroughness and attention to detail necessary for such a significant project.	The Final Bid submission date has been extended from 24 th June 2024 to 10th July 2024

4	8	In point 12.1, "After the final RFP is hosted, interested bidders may submit their bid online on GeM portal in the two separate copies/packets for Technical and Financial and hard copies in 2 separate envelopes. Packet-1 should contain technical bid as per Annexure-I and Packet-2 should contain financial bid as per Annexure-II."	We request your clarification whether the bid submission is to be done online in GeM portal and do we need to submit the hard copies of the bid documents to the DAHD Office. • Request to clarify on the end date and address of submission of hard copies of bid document if the bid is to be submitted in hard copies as well.	Bid submission only through online mode
5	18	In point 10.3, "Attach relevant documentary proof for the same by way of pay roll/salary slip/such other acceptable proof; along with proof of their consultancy/research experience. Requisite marks in technical evaluation will be based on verification of relevant proof/documents."	Requesting to clarify whether we have to furnish the details for the manpower to be deployed by the bidder for this study (Team Leader) or do we have to furnish the details of manpower of the bidder organization to meet the requirement on number of manpower. • In case details for all the organization employees are required in the format provided, we would request to limit requirement to a HR certification for employee strength and not employee wise details of the organization in the format shared	Furnish the details of manpower of the bidder organization/s to meet the requirement on number of manpower. A Certificate from HR Head mentioning the Current Employee Strength is required. However the CV of Team Leader is Mandatory to be attached.
6	9	In Point 3.2, "Experience of the Team Leader The Team Leader should have requisite experience and have demonstrated leadership in conducting such type of studies." • And point 10.3, "CV of Team Leader and Assistant. /Deputy Team leaders should also be enclosed."	We request clarification on number of personnels to be deployed for the project and marking criteria for technical evaluation for each personnel required. The marking criteria is for Team leader, however in Point 10.3 deputy team leader has been mentioned as well.	As per the RFP there has to be a Team Leader and minimum 50 Enumerators. However the Bidder has to come up with his own Team Composition for successful delivery of the Evaluation Study.

M/S –Academy of Management Studies (AMS)

Sl.	Page No.	Original Clause of RFP Document	Queries/Suggestions/Remarks	Response by DAHD
1	8	12.1 After the final RFP is hosted, interested bidders may submit their bid online on GeM portal in the two separate copies/packets for Technical and Financial and hard copies in 2 separate envelopes. Packet-1 should contain technical bid as per Annexure-I and Packet-2 should contain financial bid as per Annexure-II.	Kindly clarify if the mode of submission is online on GEM or through Hard Copy. If the submission is Hard Copy, we request you to specify the submission address.	Bid submission through online mode
2	9	1.2 The Bidder should have experience of working/assisting projects in the area of Dairy Value supply chain (Milk Procurement/ Processing/ Sales & Marketing/ Productivity Enhancement Services) in last 3 financial years	We kindly request you to remove the last 3 year limitation from this category. This would allow us to include a broader range of our relevant projects, thereby enabling us to bring our extensive experience to the table and deliver the highest quality results for this project.	No Change
3	18	CV of Team Leader and Assistant. /Deputy Team leaders should also be enclosed.	As per the Technical Bid Evaluation Criteria, the marking is provided only for the CV of Team Leader. herefore, kindly clarify if the CV of Assistant/Deputy Team Leader is also required.	CV of only Team Leader is required. However you may provide CVs of other Key Team Members whom you plan to deploy in the Study

4	16			As per the Technical Bid Evaluation Criteria, 30 marks are allotted if more than 10 assignments are provided. Therefore, kindly specify the distribution of these marks with respect to pointers 9.1, 9.2, and 9.3 mentioned in the technical bid format. This would allow us to fit in the best experiences as per the requirement.	Please refer to the Point No 14 of RFP Technical Bid Evaluation Criteria on Page No 10 & 11	
		9.1	No.ofstudies/researchstudies(hereinafterrefer redtoasStudies) conductedandcompletedinl ast5years(1stApril2018to31st March2023) of value not less than Rs 20 Lakhs.(Timelimitswillbestrictlyobserved)			Name of Project, Name of Client Objective of Study, Sample Size, Period of study, Supporting documents Consultancy Fee
		9.2	Out of above list (9.1) which at least oneshouldbefora Central Government/ State Government and			Name of Project, Name of Client Consultancy Fee
		9.3	List of impact evaluation/studies which has consultancy fee of more than Rs 25 Lakhs			Name of Project, Name of Client Consultancy Fee

M/S Ernst & Young

Sl.	Page No.	Original Clause of RFP Document	Queries/Suggestions/Remarks	Response by DAHD
1	9	Under Point no.13: The QCBS method of evaluation mentioned is 60:40.	t is requested that it may be considered as 80:20.	No Change
2		The last date of submission of bid is 24.06.24.	if it can be further extended to 20 days after pre-bid clarification being published on site to provide smooth bandwidth for timely submission.	The Final Bid submission date has been extended from 24 th June 2024 to 10th July 2024

3	9	Point 14. Clause 1.2 "The Bidder should have experience of working/assisting projects in the area of Dairy Value supply chain (Milk Procurement/ Processing/ Sales & Marketing/ Productivity Enhancement Services) in last 3 financial years- 1 mark per Project but limited to 5 Projects.	if it may be considered as limited to 03 projects	No Change
4	7	Clause 9.3 Timeframe for submission of Final report is mentioned as 02 months	If it can be increased to 03 months	The Time frame for completion of study has been increased to 3 Months.
5	13	Clause 20, Penalty Clause	If it can be relaxed.	No Change

M/S KPMG

Sl.	Page No.	Original Clause of RFP Document	Queries/Suggestions/Remarks	Response by DAHD
1		Clarification on the Conflict of working on NPDD Component B under JICA assisted project	Nippon Koi and KPMG is working as JV on NPDD B Component for JICA assisted project. Please clarify, whether the participation in this opportunity will be conflict?	The Bidding Firm has to ensure that the existing Manpower (PMC) for Component B of NPDD is not hired for the evaluation study and should work independently in every manner
2			Timeline for the Study Our submission would be that NPDD A & B is a	The Time frame for completion of study has been increased to 3 Months.

			transformational scheme is comprised of two large scale component A&B and the program is of National importance and associated with the livelihood and income generation assessment of the dairy farmers, hence at least 10 months should be given to the study as it requires physical verification and going to the field etc.	
3	Page 1 of Bid Document	Bid End Date/Time : 24-06-2024 18:00:00	After the clarification of the pre-bid query, at-least we require, two weeksto submit the proposal. Hence, request to please extend the date of submission by two weeks	The Final Bid submission date has been extended from 24 th June 2024 to 10th July 2024
4	4	4.4 Assessment of the program's impact on key performance indicators, such as increment in the milk procurement, enrollment of new members including women members, increase in sales & marketing, improvement in quality of raw & processed milk, decrease in losses due to sourage, decrease of adulteration in milk, increase in milk price paid to farmers, increase in income of IA/EIA/DCS etc., ICT infra utilization & its outcome/benefit, increase in the milk and value added product processing capacities & its utilisation, increase in production and productivity of farmers covered under the productivity enhancement activities and other project components	Regarding the assessment of program and collection of data, our submission would be 1. As per our assessment, there are some components of the Scheme is at a very initial stage, like Component B. In this condition, the quantifiable data on output-outcome analysis or the significant impact on many parameters will be a challenge, at this point of time. Please clarify? 2. To collate the data from the field, there are many sensitive area where beneficiaries may not be able to share the data as their marketing strategy? In this case how department is going to assist the agencies to get the information within the stipulated time frame. Please clarify	Answer for Point 1 : For Component B, only those Components will be reviewed where sufficient Loan/Grant has been disbursed to the End Implementing Agency. Answer for Point 2 :DAHD will provide assistance in collecting the information and would provide guidance throughout the Project incase the field team finds difficulty in collecting any information.
5		1.1 The bidder should have completed minimum 5 (five) evaluation assignments with any Center/ State/Union Territory (UT) government department or their agencies in Cooperative/ Fisheries/ Agriculture/Animal Husbandry/ Food Processing/ Dairying / Scheme Rural Development sectors in the last 5 (Five) Financial Years with minimum contract value not less than Rs. 20 Lakhs for	Our submission would be to also include the organization which is involved the Scheme evaluation and implementation as well. Therefore, The bidder should have completed minimum 5 (five) Scheme evaluation/ implementation assignments with any Center/ State/ Union Territory (UT) government department or their agencies in Cooperative/ Fisheries/ Agriculture/ Animal Husbandry/ Food Processing/ Dairying /Rural Development sectors in the last 5 (Five) Financial Years with minimum contract	No Change

		each assignment (Study Completion Certificate to be submitted as proof of successful completion) Out of the above 5 study one Study has to be of Central/State government	value not less than Rs. 20 Lakhs for each assignment (Work Order/ Contract/ Completion Certificate etc or even the ongoing project to be submitted as proof of successful completion or ongoing of the project) Out of the above 5 study/ scheme implementation one Study/ scheme has to be of Central/State government.	
6	9	3.2 Experience of the Team Leader The Team Leader should have requisite experience and have demonstrated leadership in conducting such type of studies.	The Team Leader should have requisite experience and have demonstrated leadership in conducting such type of studies/ implementation of the project.	No Change
7	9	Method of Selection: Quality and Cost Based Selection (QCBS) method of evaluation will be adopted for selecting the bidder. The technical proposals will be allotted a weightage of 60% while the financial proposals will be allotted a weightage of 40%	Method of Selection: Quality and Cost Based Selection (QCBS) method of evaluation will be adopted for selecting the bidder. The technical proposals will be allotted a weightage of 80% while the financial proposals will be allotted a weightage of 20%. This will allow technical sound and competent organizations to bid.	No Change
8	10	4.4 Proposed Impact Evaluation Team Size and Composition	Clarification : What is the Minimum Team Size required. Also are there any specific requirements other than Team Leader	As per the RFP there has to be a Team Leader and minimum 50 Enumerators. However the Bidder has to come up with his own Team Composition for successful delivery of the Evaluation Study.

M/S Nippon Koei

Sl.	Page No.	Original Clause of RFP Document	Queries/Suggestions/Remarks	Response by DAHD
1	3	Point 4.4, page 3, key performance indicators mentioned are majorly output based.	Is there any output-outcome analysis framework or a result framework with outcome indicators available with the Department or do we need to propose it and get it approved by the Department?	The Bidder may propose a comprehensive Output-Outcome analysis. However the same has to be discussed and got approved by the Department during the Inception Report Phase (in case the Project is allotted to bidder)
2	9	Bid Evaluation Criteria no.2, page 9.	In case of consortium, kindly confirm whether the Financial strength (Annual Turnover) of the Lead firm will be considered only for evaluation or will the strength of both firms be considered?	Financial strength of the Lead firm will be considered
3			Kindly provide an estimated team size and expert requirement (other than TL) for the study as it will help in preparing the Financial proposal.	As per the RFP there has to be a Team Leader and minimum 50 Enumerators. However the Bidder has to come up with his own Team Composition for successful delivery of the Evaluation Study.
4	6	Point 7.9 , page 6	For physical verification of assets, we request you to kindly provide a tentative list of assets , if available for the purpose of sampling as it will also aid in financial bid preparation.	No Change.
5			Entire sample size is to be divided into six zones and evaluated in two months' time. This appears to be a bit shorter period. We request you to extend the study timeline to from 2 months to minimum 5 months .	The Time frame for completion of study has been increased to 3 Months .
6			It is requested to kindly extend the proposal submission date to 2 weeks to ensure that we submit a comprehensive proposal.	The Final Bid submission date has been extended from 24 th June 2024 to 10th July 2024

M/S Quality Council of India

Sl.	Page No.	Original Clause of RFP Document	Queries/Suggestions/Remarks	Response by DAHD
1	9	<p>Clause 14 Technical Bid Evaluation Criteria, Sub Clause- 1.1 & 1.2- Past Experience</p> <p>The bidder should have completed minimum 5 (five) Scheme evaluation assignments with any Center/ State/ Union Territory (UT) government department or their agencies in Cooperative/ Fisheries/ Agriculture/ Animal Husbandry/ Food Processing/ Dairying /Rural Development sectors in the last 5 (Five) Financial Years with minimum contract value not less than Rs. 20 Lakhs for each assignment (Study Completion Certificate to be submitted as proof of successful completion). Out of the above 5 study one Study has to be of Central/State government.</p>	<p>1. With regard to the completion certificate, we would request DAHD to also consider other relevant documents such as Work order, last payment receipt / invoice or Payment Sanction letter or completion certificate as the required proof.</p> <p>2. We would also request MoFAHD to consider Ongoing impact evaluation studies of the listed agriculture & allied sector along with the completed studies for the evaluation of Technical Proposal. As these completed/ ongoing projects of similar nature are testimony of capabilities and capacities of the respective agencies.</p>	<p>Answer for Point 1 : No Change</p> <p>Answer for Point 2 : No Change</p>
2	9	<p>Clause 14 Technical Bid Evaluation Criteria, Sub Clause- 1.1 & 1.2- Past Experience</p> <p>Marking as per number of projects under sub-clause 1.1:</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> 5 Project – 18 Marks</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> 6 to 10 Projects – 24 Marks</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> More than 10 – 30 Marks in last 5 FY.</p> <p>Marking as per number of projects under sub-clause 1.2: <input type="checkbox"/> 1 marks for each project, maximum upto 5 marks</p>	<p>The concerned authorities are requested to clarify whether some projects submitted for fulfilling the requirement of clause 1.1 can also be considered for evaluation for fulfilling the requirements of clause 1.2? Please</p>	<p>Yes same Projects can be considered.</p>

3	4	<p>Clause 5- Methodology Sub Clause 5.1- Coverage of the study</p> <p>At present, beneficiaries from PAN-India have their project approved under the Component A whereas 8 states are participating under component B. The evaluation of the NPDD scheme will be carried out in such a manner that it provides a fair representation from all the Zones.</p>	<p>We request the authority to provide sub-component wise, state & district wise list of number of beneficiaries/stakeholders under Component A & Component B. It will be crucial for the effective designing of methodology & project financials.</p>	<p>No Change. However Tentative list of State /districts covered under NPDD scheme and probable sample States/Districts for Mid-term Evaluation Study_is provided in Annexure I.</p>
4	4	<p>Clause 6- Time frame for completion of the study</p> <p>The study has to be concluded within a period of 2 months from the date of awarding the study by the Department of Animal Husbandry & Dairying.</p>	<p>Considering the coverage of the study and the scope of work including consulting with various stakeholders of the scheme, we request to extend the timeframe for the completion of the study from 2 months to 4 months from the date of award of work</p>	<p>The Time frame for completion of study has been increased to 3 Months.</p>
5		<p>Bid Number GEM/2024/B/5 052449</p> <p>As per the tender document uploaded on GEM portal, Bid End Date/Time is 24-06-2024 18:00:00</p>	<p>We request the concerned authority to kindly extend the "Bid End Date" by two weeks as the pre bid meeting was scheduled on June 21, 2024. So, for the preparation of bid documents and necessary internal approvals of the management we request some time.</p>	<p>The Final Bid submission date has been extended from 24th June 2024 to 10th July 2024</p>

Annexure I : Tentative list of State /districts covered under NPDD scheme and probable sample States/Districts for Mid-term Evaluation Study

Sr No.	Zone	State/ UTs covered	Probable States	Districts covered	Probable Districts
1	North & Central	Chhattisgarh, Haryana, Madhya Pradesh, Punjab, Uttar Pradesh	Uttar Pradesh	Agra, Aligarh, Ambedkarnagar, Bahraich, Balrampur, Barabanki, Bareilly, Bijnor, Budaun, Bulandshahr, Etah, Etawah, Firozabad, Ghaziabad, Gonda, Hapur, Hathras, JP Nagar, Jaunpur, Lucknow, Mainpuri, Meerut, Moradabad, Muzaffarnagar, Nagar, Pilibhit, Pratapgarh, Rai Bareilly, Saharanpur, Sahjahanpur, Shamli and Shravasti	Budaun, Jaunpur, Pratapgarh
			Punjab	Amritsar, Barnala Bathinda, Faridkot, Fatehgarh, Fazilka, Ferozepur, Gurdaspur, Hoshiarpur, Jalandhar, Kapurthala, Ludhiana, Malerkotla, Mansa, Moga, Mohali, Sri Muktsar Sahib, SBS Nagar, SAS Nagar, Nawanshahar, Pathankot, Patiala, Ropar, Rupnagar, Sangrur and Tarn-Taran	Bhatinda & Jalandhar
2	South	Andhra Pradesh, Karnataka, Kerala, Puducherry, Tamil Nadu, Telangana	Karnataka	Bagalkote, Ballari, Bangalore Urban, Belagavi, Belgaum, Bellary, Bangalore Rural, Chamrajnagar, Chikballapura, Chikmagaluru, Chitradurga, Dakshina Kannada, Davanagere, Dharwad, Gadag, Hassan, Haveri, Kalaburagi, Kodagu, Kolar, Koppal, Madikeri, Mandya, Mysore, Raichur, Ramanagara, Shivamogga, Tumkur, Udupi, Uttara Kannada, Vijayanagar and Vijayapura	Bangalore & Mandya
			Kerala	Alappuzha, Ernakulam, Idukki, Kannur Kasaragod, Kollam, Kottayam, Kozhikode, Malappuram, Palakkad, Pathanamthitta, Thrissur, Trivandrum and Wayanad	Malabar- Wayanad & Palakkad Ernakulum- Ernakulum & Thrissur

			Tamilnadu	Ariyalur, Chennai, Coimbatore, Cuddalore, Darmapuri Dharmapuri, Dindigul, Erode, Kancheepuram- Kanyakumari Karur, Krishnagiri, Madurai, Namakkal, Nilgiris Perambalur, PudukottaiRamanathapuram, Ranipet, Salem, Sivagangai, Thanjavur, Theni, Thiruvallur, Thiruvalluar, Thiruvannamalai, Thoothukudi, Tirunelveli, Tirupattur, Tirupur, Tiruvannamalai, Trichy, Vellore, Villupuram, Thirunelveli, Nilgiris and Virudhunagar	Coimbatore and Madurai
3	East	Bihar, Jharkhand, Orissa, West Bengal	Bihar	Araria, Begusarai, Bhagalpur, Bhojpur, Buxar, East Champaran, West Champaran, Darbhanga, East Gopalganj, Hajipur, Kaimur Katihar, Khagaria, Kishanganj, LakhisaraiMadhepura, Madhubani, Muzaffarpur, Nalanda, Patna, Purnia, Rohtas, Saharsa, Samastipur, Saran, Sheohar, Sitamarhi, Siwan, Supaul and Vaishali	Bhojpur&Rohtas
			Orissa	Angul, Balasore, Bargarh, Bhadrak, Bolangir, Boudh, Cuttack, Dhenkanal, Gajapati, Ganjam, Jagatsinghpur, Jajpur, Jharsuguda, Kalahandi, Kendrapara, Keonjhar, Khordha, Koraput, Malkangiri, Nabarangpur, Nayagarh, Nuapada, Puri, Rayagada, Sambalpur, Sonepur and Sundergarh	Cuttack & Puri
4	West	Goa, Gujarat, Maharashtra, Rajasthan	Gujarat	Ahmedabad, Amreli, Anand, Aravali, Banaskantha, Bharuch, Bhavnagar, Botad, Chhotudepur, Dahod, Dang, Devbhumi, Dwarka, Gandhinagar, Gir Jamnagar, Junagadh, Kachchh, Kheda, Mahisagar, Mehsana, Morbi, Narmada, Navsari, Panchmahal, Patan, Porbandar, Rajkot, Sabarkantha, Somnath, Surat, Surendranagar, Tapi, Vadodara and Valsad	Anand & Mehsana
			Rajasthan	Ajmer, Baran, Barmer, Bharatpur, Bhilwara, Bikaner, Chhitorgarh, Churu, Dausa, Hanumangarh, Jaipur, Jaisalmer, Jalore, Jhalawar, Jodhpur, Karouli, Nagour, Pali, Rajsamand, Sawaimadhoper, Sikar, Sriganganagar, Tonk and Udaipur	Bhilwara & Jaipur

5	North East	Arunachal Pradesh, Assam, Manipur, Meghalaya, Mizoram, Nagaland, Sikkim, Tripura	Meghalaya	East Khasi Hills, West Jaintia Hills, West Garo Hills, Ri-bhoi, East Jaintia Hills, South Garo Hills, West Khasi Hills, South West Khasi Hills, East Garo Hills, South West Garo Hills & North Garo Hills	East Khasi Hills & Ribhoi
			Sikkim	East, West, South & North, Gangtok, Geyzing, Namchi, Pakyong and Soreng	Gangtok & Pakyong
6	Northern Hilly States	Himachal Pradesh, Jammu & Kashmir and Uttarakhand	Himachal Pradesh	Bilaspur, Chamba, Hamirpur, Kangra, Kinnaur, Kullu, Mandi, Rohru, Shimla, Sirmour, Solan and Una	Mandi & Bilaspur
			Uttarakhand	Almora, Chamoli, Champawat, Dehradun, Haridwar, Nainital, Pauri, Pithoragarh, Rudrapur, Tehri, Udham Singh Nagar and Uttarkashi	Champawat & Pithoragarh
7	UT	Pondicherry & Jammu & Kashmir	Jammu & Kashmir	Anantnag, Bandipora, Baramulla, Budgam, Ganderbal, Jammu, Kathua, Kulgam, Kupwara, Poonch, Pulwama, Rajouri, Ramban, Reasi, Samba, Shopian, Srinagar and Udhampur,	Jammu & Pulwama/Anantnag